

**From:** Michael Mann [mmann00@comcast.net]  
**Sent:** 10/25/2012 11:28:24 PM  
**To:** dave souza [thedavesouza@gmail.com]  
**CC:** John R. Mashey [mash@heymash.com]; William Connolley [wmconnolley@gmail.com]  
**Subject:** Re: Wikipedia Acknowledgement of my role in 2007 Nobel Peace Prize

Dave,

I am responding to her right now. I will bcc each of you. Frankly, I am not happy that she has decided to drag my entire department into the matter by contacting our department webmaster and our official department contact email ([meteodept@meteo.psu.edu](mailto:meteodept@meteo.psu.edu)). That is \*not\* acceptable behavior, and her questions are leading ones. But I am going to respond calmly to this.

It is not at all obvious to me that she is in any way an "ally". Sorry--I don't see it at all exhibited in her pattern of behavior.

But the facts I am providing speak for themselves, and if this doesn't resolve matters then I would like this to be taken above her to a higher level of Wikipedia mediation.

Mike

On Oct 25, 2012, at 6:55 PM, dave souza wrote:

Thanks Mike,

Yopienso has sent me a copy of an email she's sent to your PSU office so I suggest making sure she gets an early reply to that, with an image of the IPCC certificate. I've forwarded it to you, but please don't reply to her on that forwarded version. Have had many arguments with her, but she's reasonable and can be an ally.

Mongabay looks good, will have to check it as a reliable source but think that's all I need there, dave

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 11:28 PM, Michael Mann <[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:  
thank Dave, you're right, don't mean to impute motives. but the official IPCC certificate is absolutely unimpeachable and its just extremely difficulty for me to imagine an honest argument against using the precise wording as it appears on the certificate (!).

the wording you cite is from a press release that was sent to reporters at the time. It exists in the form of a word document which I've attached. The release, or at least parts of it, are quoted in various news accounts, e.g.:  
<http://news.mongabay.com/2006/0716-climate.html>

That's really about all there is to that, so hopefully that provides you the info you need?  
mike

[see attached file: Statement.doc]

On Oct 25, 2012, at 6:06 PM, dave souza wrote:

Hi Mike, I don't think the editor being awkward is being dishonest, he or she is just sticking closely to the rules and in my view being a bit pernicky. I've not yet cited your Facebook page, but may come to that if questioned.

It's not urgent, but what I need is a link to the press release at a source where other editors can verify it, the one cited by Gavin starts "The un-peer reviewed report commissioned by Rep. Barton released today adds nothing

new to the scientific discourse on climate change and is a poor attempt to further personalize and politicize what should be a matter of scientific debate not politics."

Even better would be a news article that quoted you. If it's not available online, not to worry as my aim is to rewrite that bit anyway on the basis of your book and the sources you cite.

Will be back with more questions, but not tonight! dave

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 10:49 PM, Michael Mann <[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

Dave, any challenge at this point is fundamentally dishonest and in bad faith. The official IPCC recognition is unambiguous. You have simply included the precise wording that was used by the IPCC themselves. Don't let these dishonest actors get away with this despicable attack.

Re other matter w/ HS page , you need to provide me further info what you are talking about? I did issue a press release. Do you want a copy of that?

Mike

--

Michael E. Mann

Professor

Director, Earth System Science Center (ESSC)

[www.michaelmann.net](http://www.michaelmann.net)

[www.thehockeystick.net](http://www.thehockeystick.net)

[www.direpredictions.com](http://www.direpredictions.com)

On Oct 25, 2012, at 5:43 PM, dave souza <[thedavesouza@gmail.com](mailto:thedavesouza@gmail.com)> wrote:

Still having to justify it as you can see from the article talk page, had to rush off without citing your book properly. A third party reliable source would be a great help.

On the main HS article, we've an issue with the released comment you gave when the Wegman report was published, which we've only found as a comment by Gavin, and can't really use blog comments: is that published somewhere else?

"'The Discovery of Global Warming' update". [Realclimate.org](http://Realclimate.org). 2006-07-14

- dave

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 7:26 PM, Michael Mann <[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

Great. Huge relief. Just posted an item to Facebook and twitter on this matter by the way, Mike

--

Michael E. Mann

Professor

Director, Earth System Science Center (ESSC)

[www.michaelmann.net](http://www.michaelmann.net)

[www.thehockeystick.net](http://www.thehockeystick.net)

[www.direpredictions.com](http://www.direpredictions.com)

On Oct 25, 2012, at 2:05 PM, dave souza <[thedavesouza@gmail.com](mailto:thedavesouza@gmail.com)> wrote:

Mike, I can go along with that:

Lead author on the [[IPCC Third Assessment Report]], <br>contributed to the award of the [[Nobel Peace Prize|2007 Nobel Peace Prize]] to the IPCC, jointly with [[Al Gore]]<br>

Will add some info to the body first, it could be useful if that photo of the certificate/plaque is online somewhere other than on Milloy's blog.

yrs, dave

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 6:47 PM, Michael Mann <[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

Dave I think your wording is needlessly watered down. The IPCC clearly indicates that I 'contributed to the award of the Nobel Prize'. It would be unfair to me and other lead authors to state any less. I can't see a legitimate counter argument against this. I really cannot. Please don't give into the tactics of our detractors to 'work the refs', which is clearly what is happening here.

Mike

--

Michael E. Mann  
Professor  
Director, Earth System Science Center (ESSC)  
[www.michaelmann.net](http://www.michaelmann.net)  
[www.thehockeystick.net](http://www.thehockeystick.net)  
[www.direpredictions.com](http://www.direpredictions.com)

On Oct 25, 2012, at 1:37 PM, dave souza <[thedavesouza@gmail.com](mailto:thedavesouza@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi Mike,  
Because so many got it, it's a bit difficult to highlight it on infoboxes. There's not even any mention of it in Ben Santer's bio, which should be put right.

I'm coming round to adding:

Lead author on the 2007 report by the IPCC, which was awarded the Nobel Peace Prize jointly with Al Gore.

The body text can clearly note that you received a personalized plaque showing the Nobel Diploma  
[http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel\\_prizes/peace/laureates/2007/ipcc-diploma.html](http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/peace/laureates/2007/ipcc-diploma.html)

Yes, various shorthand terms have been used and Pachauri was particularly effusive: guess you got this letter?

<http://www.csiro.au/Organisation-Structure/Divisions/Marine--Atmospheric-Research/NobelPeacePrizeWinners.aspx>

No doubt you'll have seen the nasty Milloy piece back in March"  
<http://junkscience.com/2012/03/22/ipcc-manns-claim-of-receiving-nobel-prize-is-wrong/>

From that it's indisputable that authors and others

"received a certificate commemorating their involvement with the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), which received the 2007 Nobel Peace Prize along with former Vice President Albert Arnold (Al) Gore Jr.

About 2000 personalized copies of the 2007 Nobel Peace Prize together with a letter of Dr R.K. Pachauri have been sent worldwide....."

Gotta stop for a bit now, dave

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 5:58 PM, Michael Mann

<[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

Here, as one quick example, is the CV of the dean of my college, Bill Easterling, who was an IPCC lead author.

His CV reads:

The IPCC, its Chairpersons, and Lead Authors were co-awarded the 2007 Nobel Peace Prize with former Vice President Al Gore.

you would find the award described that way by many, many IPCC lead authors. This is a reasonable shorthand for "contributed to the award" which is what the official certificates to us from the IPCC say!

mike

[see attached file: Easterling\_ExtCV\_011612.pdf]

On Oct 25, 2012, at 12:43 PM, dave souza wrote:

Hi Mike, there have been attempts before to remove it, so that's not new. I agree that the IP asking for this looks like pov pushing, but the removal was by a reasonable editor on the grounds that "the official Nobel Prize website does not say Mann was co-awarded any prize. [It says](#), "The Nobel Peace Prize has been awarded 93 times to 124 Nobel Laureates between 1901 and 2012, 100 individuals and 24 organizations.""

The infobox wording was

Co-awarded with other [IPCC report](#) authors [2007 Nobel Peace Prize](#), jointly with [Al Gore](#)

My feeling is that it will be more likely to stay if we modify the wording and provide more sources supporting the words. We've got a source saying the IPCC as an organization was given the award, while your book is good I'd really like at the very least an independent source saying that the award went to authors of the report.

Will try a hunt for something. dave souza

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 5:33 PM, Michael Mann

<[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

Of course these are the same 'birther' types who will claim the certificate is a forgery etc. for them evidence is just an indication that the conspiracy runs deeper. For any reasonable person, the certificate/plaque would be enough,  
Mike

--

Michael E. Mann

Professor

Director, Earth System Science Center (ESSC)

[www.michaelmann.net](http://www.michaelmann.net)

[www.thehockeystick.net](http://www.thehockeystick.net)

[www.direpredictions.com](http://www.direpredictions.com)

On Oct 25, 2012, at 12:18 PM, dave souza

<[thedavesouza@gmail.com](mailto:thedavesouza@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi Mike,

It's correct that the award is mentioned in the lead, as it should be, though the layout and information needs to be tightened. I'm not a fan of infoboxes, and any wording there has to be concise but avoid any exaggeration. The only source we've got is your PSU bio which says "He shared the Nobel Peace Prize with other IPCC authors in 2007." It would help immensely if you could point out any independent reliable online sources such as news articles that cover this award to you: blogs aren't any good for this purpose.

More detail is needed in the body of the article. In your book p. 176 says in 2007 lead authors got a plaque, which is presumably what's in the picture, do you have a figure for how many lead authors there were? You add that at a meeting celebrating the Nobel prize you with Ben Santer were singled out by Susan Solomon for special commendation. The footnote p. 139 says this was at an IPCC conference held in Honolulu in 2009. I've tried searching for independent coverage of this commendation, but couldn't find any: can you point to a source?

dave souza

On Thu, Oct 25, 2012 at 4:57 PM, John R. Mashey

<[mash@heymash.com](mailto:mash@heymash.com)> wrote:

I'm out of it today with a Board meeting and dentist.

Sent from my iPhone

On Oct 25, 2012, at 8:39 AM, Michael Mann  
<[mmann00@comcast.net](mailto:mmann00@comcast.net)> wrote:

in fact, in the very first paragraph  
this is still acknowledged:

He was a member of  
the [IPCC](#) jointly  
awarded the [Nobel  
Peace Prize](#) with [Al  
Gore](#) in 2007.

it needs to be restored to the sidebar  
bio as well under "Honors". No  
question about it. Come on guys, just  
a little help here?  
mike

On Oct 25, 2012, at 11:37 AM,  
Michael Mann wrote:

and \*even\* if they wanted to  
complain about the specific wording,  
there is absolutely no way to justify  
entirely removing from this section  
the formal acknowledgment of my  
role as an IPCC lead author. That is  
completely out of bounds,  
m

On Oct 25, 2012, at 11:35 AM,  
Michael Mann wrote:

William,  
yes--but IPCC lead authors and  
chairs have typically been included  
as having shared the report. You saw  
the certificate that I received from  
the IPCC acknowledging my  
contribution to the Nobel Peace  
Prize, right (?).  
Attached to this email too.

This was part of the Wikipedia page  
for many months now and nobody  
complained until the recent attack by

Watts and National Review motivated this revisionism. I don't think its in keeping w/ Wikipedia practice for one person to change something like this unilaterally, right???

Just asking for a bit of help here!

mike

<NobelPrize.jpg>

On Oct 25, 2012, at 10:55 AM,  
William Connolley wrote:

This is a transparent,  
unacceptable effort at  
revisionist history by  
climate change  
deniers.

Yes it is, but that doesn't make it wrong. I don't think wiki makes any systematic attempt to note who counts as having been "co-awarded" the prize. Dave may well have a better answer.

-William

--

William M. Connolley |  
[www.wmconnolley.org.uk](http://www.wmconnolley.org.uk) | 07985  
935400

--

Michael E. Mann  
Professor  
Director, Earth System Science Center  
(ESSC)

Department of  
Meteorology Phone: (814) 863-  
[4075](tel:8148634075)  
503 Walker  
Building FAX: (814) 865-  
[3663](tel:8148653663)  
The Pennsylvania State  
University email: [mann@psu.edu](mailto:mann@psu.edu)

University Park, PA 16802-  
5013 [www.michaelmann.net](http://www.michaelmann.net)

"The Hockey Stick and the  
Climate Wars":

[www.thehockeystick.net](http://www.thehockeystick.net)

"Dire Predictions": [www.direpredictions.com](http://www.direpredictions.com)